



The Explanation of the Hadeeth
**Reward of Deeds
Depends Upon the
Intention**

from the book

Forty Ahaadeeth al-Nawawee

of Imaam Yahya bin Sharaful-Deen al-Nawawee رحمه الله

by his eminence

Shaikh Muhammad ibn Saalih al-'Uthaymeen رحمه الله

Special thanks to the Brothers and Sisters whose contributions
helped to make this work a reality.

Index

Preface

The explanation by Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen

The Khilaafah (caliphate) of Abu Bakr and `Umar رضي الله عنهما

More evidences to support the meaning of this Hadeeth

The first point of discussion: Eloquence

The second point of discussion: the grammar

From the language point of view

An Issue: Do these two sentences mean the same?

The Rule

The Objective of Intention

Differentiating between habits and worship

Differentiating between different acts of worship

Place of Intention is the heart

An Issue: Is not Talbiyah the articulation of intention?

The grade of the people varies based on their intention

An Issue: Hijrah is it compulsory or optional?

Meaning of “migration towards Allaah and His Messenger”

An Issue: Is it possible now to migrate towards the Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم?

Migrating for worldly benefits

The Status of the Saheehain

Points of benefit from this Hadeeth

An Issue: Times when a person forgets to make an intention

An Issue: Is it Halaal or Haraam to combine the names of Allaah and His Messenger?

An Issue: What is better, (seeking) knowledge or Jihaad?

An Issue: Is Hijrah obligatory or something preferred? (Additional points)

A Clarification: Can we judge someone’s intention?

Preface

All praises be to Allaah; we praise Him, and seek His help and forgiveness. We seek refuge in Allaah from the evil of our own selves, and the evil consequences of our deeds. Whosoever Allaah guides, no one can misguide him. And whomsoever Allaah misguides, no one can guide him. We bear witness that no one has the right to be worshipped except Allaah, and we bear witness that Prophet Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم is the Slave and Messenger of Allaah.

May peace and blessings of Allaah be upon His last and final Messenger, upon his family and companions, and upon those who follow them with righteousness till the Day of Judgment!

Verily, the best speech is the Book of Allaah (Qur'aan). The best guidance is the guidance of Prophet Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم. The most evil of matters is innovation, and every innovation is a heresy, and every heresy is misguidance and every misguidance is in Hell.

Note: This document is an on-line book publication of www.foodiefahoodie.blogspot.com. This book was formatted and designed specifically for being placed on the Internet for free. We allow for this document, in its present form and with no alterations, to be distributed, printed, photocopied, reproduced and/or dispersed by electronic means for the purpose of spreading its content and not for the purpose of gaining a profit, unless a specific request is sent to the publishers and permission is granted.

About the Book: This is the translation of Shaikh Muhammad Ibn Saaleh al-`Uthaymeen's رحمه الله explanation of the very first Hadeeth from al-Arba`een al-Nawaweeyah (Forty Ahaadeeth al-Nawawee): **"Rewards of Deeds depend upon the intention"**. The purpose here is to help the English speaking readers to benefit from the explanation of the esteemed Shaikh رحمه الله in understanding the meaning of this Hadeeth. We would like to note that the translation was made as close as possible to the meaning of the original text and not always done verbatim as a translation of that sort loses its essence in some cases. Further, the footnotes are the words of the translator to help the reader better understand the points being made.

About the Hadeeth:

Narrated `Umar bin al-Khattaab رضي الله عنه: I heard Allaah's Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **"Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended. So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger, then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger. And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits or for a woman to marry, his emigration was for what he emigrated for."** [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (1, 54, 2529, 3898, 5070, 6689, 6953) and Saheeh Muslim (3537)]

Ibn Rajab رحمه الله mentioned:

There is a consensus amongst the scholars about the authenticity of this Hadeeth and they have accepted it whole heartedly. Imaam al-Bukhaaree began his book "al-Saheeh" with this Hadeeth as a preface, indicating with it that every action which is not done for seeking the Countenance of Allaah (and His pleasure), then it will be void of any reward and the person will not benefit with it – neither in this world, nor in the hereafter.

And that is why `Abdul-Rahmaan bin al-Mahdee said: "If I were to write a book with many topics and chapters, I would have begun every chapter with the Hadeeth of `Umar **"Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention"**." And he also said: "If any wants to write a book, let him begin with this Hadeeth."

This Hadeeth is considered to be one of the greatest Ahaadeeth around which the whole of Islaam revolves.

And it is reported that Imaam al-Shaafi'ee رحمه الله said: "This Hadeeth is one third of the knowledge of Islaam; and it can be related with about 70 topics of Fiqh."

Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله said: "Islaam is based on three fundamental Ahaadeeth:

i. The Hadeeth of `Umar رضي الله عنه: **"Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention"**.

- ii. Hadeeth of `Aaishah رضي الله عنها: **“Whosoever introduces into this affair of ours (i.e. Islaam) something that does not belong to it, it is to be rejected.”**
- iii. Hadeeth of al-Nu`maan bin Basheer رضي الله عنه: **“Truly, what is lawful is evident, and what is unlawful is evident.”** [Ibn Rajab: Jaami` al-`uloom wal-Hikam (1/61)]

This Hadeeth emphasizes the importance of Ikhlāas (sincerity and purity of intention - to be truthful and honest to Allaah alone, performing an act solely for Allaah's sake whereby nothing is sought except Allaah's Countenance and His pleasure). Ikhlāas is one of the conditions of accepting good deeds. The other condition is that the actions must be done in accordance with the Sharee`ah.

This can also be seen in the Shahaadah: لا إله إلا الله محمد رسول الله

“I bear witness that there is no one worthy of being worshiped but Allaah” is the Ikhlāas - ensuring that we do things for the sake of Allaah and Allaah alone.

“I bear witness that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allaah” - the Sunnah is the manifestation of the Qur'aan - the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم is our example, our best model to follow. Following his Sunnah in our acts of `Ibaadah, Akhlāaq (ethics), and Mu`amalaat (dealings) ensures that we are acting in accordance with the Sharee`ah.

Thus, the Shahaadah shows us the conditions for accepting a deed or performing an action: (a) it should be for the sake of Allaah because He is the only One we worship, and (b) it should be in accordance with the Sharee`ah.

To achieve Ikhlāas, we have to avoid all forms of Shirk (associating others with Allaah, which causes insincerity). And from the root cause for insincerity (or shirk) is self-desire (al-Hawa). Therefore no action should be done because of self-desire.

There are 6 types of self-desire which oppose Ikhlāas:

- i. To make oneself appear good in the hearts of others.

- ii. To seek the praises of others.
- iii. To avoid being blamed by others.
- iv. To seek the glorification of others.
- v. To seek the wealth/money of others.
- vi. To seek the services or love of others.

Ways to obtain Ikhlaas:

- i. Do righteous deeds: the more good deeds we do and hence get closer to Allaah, the more sincere we will be.
- ii. Before we do any deed we should firstly seek knowledge (`ilm): our actions/deeds should be guided by knowledge so that we do them in accordance to the Sharee`ah.
- iii. Do not give false impressions: do not make others believe that an action we did was good when it was not.
- iv. Before you do anything, check your intention (niyyah): ask yourself before performing an action: "Is it for the sake of Allaah?"

Any action we do is subject to three defects:

- i. Being conscious that others are observing our actions.
- ii. Seeking a return (benefit/reward) for the action.
- iii. Being satisfied with the action.

There are four things that contradict Ikhlaas:

- i. Ma`siah: committing sins - this will weaken our Ikhlaas.
- ii. Shirk: associating others with Allaah.
- iii. Riya: performing an `Ibaadah with the intention of showing off to others.
- iv. Nifaaq: hypocrisy – performing an act of `Ibaadah but internally not liking it or doing it out of the fear of being punished or reprimanded. Example: a person prays only because he doesn't want to be rebuked by his friends.

وصلى الله وسلم وبارك على نبينا محمد وعلى آله وأصحابه ومن تبعهم بإحسان إلى يوم الدي

From Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen's explanation:

عَنْ أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَبِي حَفْصٍ عُمَرَ بْنِ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَنْهُ قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ:
إِنَّمَا الْأَعْمَالُ بِالنِّيَّاتِ، وَإِنَّمَا لِكُلِّ امْرِئٍ مَا نَوَى، فَمَنْ كَانَتْ هِجْرَتُهُ إِلَى اللَّهِ وَرَسُولِهِ فَهِجْرَتُهُ إِلَى اللَّهِ
وَرَسُولِهِ، وَمَنْ كَانَتْ هِجْرَتُهُ لِدُنْيَا يُصِيبُهَا، أَوْ امْرَأَةٍ يَنْكِحُهَا، فَهِجْرَتُهُ إِلَى مَا هَاجَرَ إِلَيْهِ

Narrated `Umar bin al-Khattaab رضى الله عنه: I heard Allaah's Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم saying:

“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended. So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger, then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger. And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits or for a woman to marry, his emigration was for what he emigrated for.”

Reported by the Imaam of the Muhadditheen, Abu `Abdullaah Muhammad bin Ismaa`eel bin Ibraaheem bin al-Mugheerah bin Bardizbah al-Bukhaaree and by Abu al-Husain Muslim bin al-Hajjaaj bin Muslim al-Qushaaree al-Nisaabooree in their Saheeh, which are the most authentic books ever written (by a human). [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (1, 54, 2529, 3898, 5070, 6689, 6953) and Saheeh Muslim (3537)]

Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen رحمه الله said:

On the authority of Ameer al-Mu'mineen and he is Abu Hafs `Umar bin al-Khattaab رضى الله عنه, who was made the Khaleefah by Abu Bakr al-Siddeeq's رضى الله عنه nomination.

The Khilaafah (caliphate) of Abu Bakr and `Umar رضي الله عنه ما:

From the many good deeds of Abu Bakr رضي الله عنه is that `Umar bin al-Khattaab رضي الله عنه was appointed as the legitimate Khaleefah. Abu Bakr رضي الله عنه had nominated him and Abu Bakr رضي الله عنه was nominated (as a Khaleefah) from the pledge given to him by the other Companions at al-Saqeebah (in the shed of Banee Saa'idah). Likewise, `Umar's رضي الله عنه Caliphate was as legitimate as the Caliphate of Abu Bakr رضي الله عنه. The choice of Abu Bakr رضي الله عنه was indeed a good one when he chose `Umar رضي الله عنه.

More evidences to support the meaning of this Hadeeth:

And in his (`Umar's رضي الله عنه) saying: "I heard" is a proof that he has heard it directly from the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم without any intermediaries. And it is surprising, given its importance, no one reported this Hadeeth from the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم except `Umar رضي الله عنه. But still, it does have supporting evidences from the Qur'aan and the Sunnah. In the Qur'aan Allaah تعالى says:

{وَمَا تُنْفِقُونَ إِلَّا ابْتِغَاءَ وَجْهِ اللَّهِ}

{...when you spend not except seeking Allaah's Countenance} [Surah al-Baqarah (2): 272]

This (above mentioned verse) is (about making proper) intention. The following Aayah too is about intention, Allaah تعالى says:

{مُحَمَّدٌ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ وَالَّذِينَ مَعَهُ أَشِدَّاءُ عَلَى الْكُفَّارِ رُحَمَاءُ بَيْنَهُمْ تَرَاهُمْ رُكَّعًا سُجَّدًا يَبْتَغُونَ

فَضْلًا مِنَ اللَّهِ وَرِضْوَانًا}

{Muhammad [صلى الله عليه وسلم] is the Messenger of Allaah. And those who are with him are severe against disbelievers, and merciful among themselves. You see them bowing and falling down prostrate (in prayer), seeking bounty from Allaah and (His) Good Pleasure.} [Surah al-Fath (48): 29]

The Prophet رضي الله عنه صلى الله عليه وسلم said to Sa'd ibn Abi Waqqaas:

وَأَعْلَمَ أَنَّكَ لَنْ تُنْفِقَ نَفَقَةً تَبْتَغِي بِهَا وَجْهَ اللَّهِ إِلَّا أُجِرْتَ عَلَيْهَا حَتَّى مَا تَجْعَلُهُ فِي فِي امْرَأَتِكَ

“You will be rewarded for whatever you spend seeking with it Allaah’s Countenance even if it were a morsel which you put in your wife’s mouth.” [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (56, 1296, 3936, 4409, 5668, 6373) and Saheeh Muslim (3084)]

His صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“seeking with it Allaah’s Countenance”**, this regards intention (i.e. making intention sincerely for Allaah).

It is important to note that the meaning of this Hadeeth is confirmed from the Qur’aan and the Sunnah. Even though `Umar رضي الله عنه was alone in reporting this Hadeeth with such wordings, the Ummah, as a whole, have received this Hadeeth with complete acceptance to such an extent that Imaam al-Bukhaaree رحمه الله began his Saheeh with this Hadeeth.

And in his صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended”**, in this sentence there are two points of discussion: The first is from the point of its eloquence.

The first point of discussion: Eloquence

His صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“The reward of deeds depends upon the intention”**, in it there is a distinct eloquence (speech) confining (that which has been said), being the affirmation of the command that which is mentioned and the negation of other than that. The way of confinement is the word: **“إِنَّمَا”** (verily/truly), because the word **“إِنَّمَا”** limits (the meaning of what is being said).

For example if one says: **“Zaid is standing”**, then this does not confine Zaid to be standing only (for he might be doing something else also). If one says: **“Verily Zaid is standing”**, confinement is applied, that Zaid is doing nothing except standing. Similarly, the saying of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم: **“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended,”** there is an application of confinement.

And in his صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits or for a woman to marry, his emigration was for what he emigrated for”**, is (the transmission of) the message: about the hidden intention of the one who migrated for worldly purpose. (In the end) the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“his emigration was for what he emigrated for”**, and he صلى الله عليه وسلم did not just say: **“he will get the worldly benefit”** (i.e. there is no guarantee that he will get the woman or the worldly benefit for which he migrated. But the one who migrated for his religion will surely find his reward with Allaah).

The benefit in this message (from which the lesson can be derived) is: the abasement of the thing for which this man migrated. His mentioning here is not a praise rather to characterize him (as the one who migrated for worldly benefit).^[1]

And his صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger”**, and the response: **“then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger,”** was to acknowledge his excellence to contrast.

And in this sentence: **“And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits or for a woman to marry, his emigration was for what he emigrated for”**, the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“لِلدُّنْيَا”** (for worldly benefits) and he did not say: **“إِلَى دُنْيَا”** (towards worldly benefits), because this shows the inferiority of the matter for which he migrated; i.e. the worldly benefit.^[2]

[1] Ibn al-Hajar mentioned in Fath al-Baaree that al-Tabaraanee reported: “There was a man amongst us that got engaged to a woman called Umm Qays, however she refused to marry him unless he migrated to Madeenah, so he migrated and married her. So we used to call him the migrater for Umm Qays.” Ibn Hajar further says: “This narration is correct according to the criteria of al-Bukhaaree and Muslim; however there is nothing in it indicating that the Hadeeth concerning actions being based on intentions was based on that specific story.” [Fath al-Baaree (1/10)]

[2] The reason for it being referred as ignoble is what the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“This world is cursed and so are all the things in it, except the remembrance of Allaah and that, which He (Allaah) likes, and the scholars and the students.”** [Tirmidhee (2322), Ibn Maajah (4112) on the authority of Abu Hurairah رضى الله عنه and graded as **“Hasan”** by Shaikh al-Albaanee in al-Saheehah (2797)]

The second point of discussion here is from the grammatical point:

So his صلى الله عليه وسلم saying: **“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention”** contains subject and predicate. “Deeds” is the subject and “intention” is the predicate.

“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended” also contains subject and predicate. In this case, the predicate precedes the subject, **“intended,”** in his saying: **“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended.”**

“So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger, then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger” is a conditional sentence. The tool of condition in this sentence is the word **“من”** (whosoever); and the reaction to the condition is the word **“كانت”** (then); and the answer to the condition is: **“his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger”**.

And the same grammar structure is in the following sentence **“And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits”**.

From the language point of view:

“الأعمال” (deeds) is the plural of **“عمل”** (deed), which constitutes of deeds of the heart, of the speech, and of the body parts. So this includes all types of deeds.

From the actions of the heart is having trust in Allaah (Tawakkul), turning to Him (Inaabah), fearing Him (Khashyah) etc.

From “the act of speech” is what the tongue utters. And (look) how much the tongue utters. For I do not know if there is any part of the body which is put more into action (is more used) other than the tongue except maybe the eyes and the ears.

Bodily actions consist of the deeds done by the limbs – the hands, the legs etc.

“النيات” singular “نية” linguistically means “قصد” (aim at/to seek to/have in mind).

Islaamically it means: determination in doing a deed which will take you closer to Allaah. And the place of intention is the heart. Making intention is from the action of the heart and not from the actions of the tongue and the limbs.

An Issue: Do these two sentences mean the same?

“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention; and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended.”

Q) Do these two sentences mean the same or do they differ?

A) It is necessary to know that originally the speech (in the second sentence) is for establishing (the fact) and not for reaffirming (the first sentence).

“Establishing”, meaning: the second sentence has a meaning of its own (i.e. it has an independent meaning).

“Reaffirming”, meaning: the second sentence has the same meaning as the first one.

The Scholars رحمهم الله have two opinions on this issue. The first (group) says: The meaning of both these sentences is one. The Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention”** and then he صلى الله عليه وسلم reaffirmed it by saying: **“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended”**.

The other (opinion) says: The second sentence is different from the first one. The second sentence is for establishing and not for reaffirming.

The Rule:

When an issue entertains two opinions whether the speech is for “establishing” or for “reaffirming”; then we take it for “establishing” and make the second (sentence) different from the first one. For if one were to make the second (sentence) similar to the first one, then there is a repetition (of sentences) for which we need to know the reason (for the repetition).

The correct opinion is: the second sentence is different from the first one. In regards to the intention, the first sentence is for the action (itself), whereas the second sentence is for the one who is carrying it out – did you do it for Allaah’s sake or did you do it for a worldly benefit? The proof for this is the saying of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم: **“So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger, then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger”**. So with this it is understood that there is no repetition in the speech.

The Objective of Intention:

The objective of intention is to differentiate between habit and worship; and to distinguish between different types of worship.

Differentiating between habits and worship:

Example 1: One person eats food to fill his desire only, whereas another man eats food in fulfilling the command of Allaah:

{ وَكُلُوا وَاشْرَبُوا }

{and eat and drink} [Surah al-A`raaf (7): 31]

So the action of the second person is worship, while the eating of the first one is a habit.

Example 2: A person takes a shower to cool down, whereas the second person takes a shower due to ceremonial impurity. So the action of the first one is a habit, whereas the action of the second one is worship. So if a person who is ceremonially impure takes a dive in the sea to cool down then prays; his prayer is invalid due to his intention. The reason being, he did not intend to (purify himself for) worship but only to cool down.

Due to this, some of the scholars have said: Worship of the careless person is his habit; whereas the habits of a prudent one are his worship (i.e. the careless person does the acts of worship due to it becoming a habit, while the prudent converts his habits into acts of worship).

An example of a careless person is: the one who wakes up, makes ablution and prays as per his routine. Whereas the prudent one makes his habits into worship, example: the one who eats, obeying the commands of Allaah and to maintain himself and wants to be independent from the people (for his needs) – then this becomes worship.

Another example of a careless person is: a man who wears new clothes out of arrogance, this type of action has no reward. The example of a prudent is: a man who wears new clothes to show the people that Allaah تعالى as blessed him and that he is rich^[3], as such he will be rewarded.

A person wears good clothes only because it is Friday, so this is a habit. The second person wears good clothes in following the example of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم, so this is worship.

Differentiating between different acts of worship:

A person intends to pray two voluntary Rak`ah and another person intends to pray two obligatory Rak`ah. The actions are same, but are distinguished because of the intention, one is voluntary and the other is obligatory.

[3] Based on the Hadeeth: Abul-Ahwas reported that his father said: the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم saw him wearing old, tattered clothes, and asked him: **“Do you have any wealth?”** I said: “Yes - for Allaah has given me camels and sheep.” He صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“Then show the generous blessings that He (تعالى) has given you.”** [Sunan al-Tirmidhee (2006) and graded as **“Saheeh”** by Shaikh al-Albaanee]

And `Amr ibn Shuayb reported from his father from his grandfather that Allaah’s Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **“Allaah loves to see signs of His blessings on His slave.”** [Sunan al-Tirmidhee (2819) and graded as **“Hasan Saheeh”** by Shaikh al-Albaanee]

So it is understood that the object of intention is to distinguish between different acts of worship like between voluntary and obligatory prayer or to differentiate between worship and habit.^[4]

Place of Intention is the heart:

And know that the place of intention is the heart and it is not to be articulated - neither loudly nor silently. (For Allaah is al-Khabeer, al-`Aleem and al-Baseer). He Knows what the eyes betrays and what the heart conceals. For He is Allaah, the Knower of what is in the heart; and one would not like to worship a being who does not know what he intends unless he articulates it; but he would like to worship the One who knows what the inner self whispers and who knows the future, the past and the present.

As a result, it is no coincidence that there is no narration, neither from the Prophet ﷺ nor from the Companions, that they ever articulated their intention. So the articulation of the intention, either done loudly or silently, is a Bid`ah (innovation).

Glory be to Allaah! How far away is the Prophet ﷺ from this (Bid`ah). For if it was from the religion, the Prophet ﷺ would have articulated his intention and would have informed the people.

^[4] More on [The Purpose of Intention](#)

Let's take an example from the following story: Once a man from al-Najd was in Masjid al-Haraam for Dhuhr prayer. Next to him was a man who was in the habit of articulating his intention. When the time for prayer came, the person who would articulate his intention said: "O Allaah! I intend to pray the Dhuhr prayer, four Rak'ah for the sake of Allaah, behind this Imaam of the Masjid al-Haraam." So as he was about to say the Takbeer, the man from al-Najd said to him: "Wait! Wait! You still have to say the date, the day, the month and the year" which left him astonished.

An Issue: Is not Talbiyah the articulation of intention?

Q) So if someone asks about the Talbiyah, by saying: Labbaik Allaahumma `Umrah or Labbaik Hajja or Labbaik Allaahumma `Umrah wa Hajja, is this not the articulation of intention?

A) The response is: No! For this is the proclamation of the ceremonial rites of Hajj. That is why some of the scholars have said: The Talbiyah of Hajj is like the Takbeerat al-Ihraam (the opening Takbeer [saying: Allaahu Akbar]) in the prayer. So, if the person does not make the Talbiyah, he has not entered Ihraam, similar to the one who has not said the Takbeerat al-Ihraam, he has not started his prayer.

Therefore, it is not from the Sunnah as some of them say: "O Allaah I intend to perform the rituals of `Umrah" or "Hajj, so make it easy for me" – because such types of invocations require evidence, and there is no evidence for this. That is why we reject the articulation of intention – but with softness, by saying: "O brother! The Prophet ﷺ did not say this nor did his companions, so don't do it."

But if someone says: “It is mentioned that such-and-such said in such-and-such book”. We should simply reply to him: “The evidence is what Allaah said and what His Messenger ﷺ said.”

The grade of the people varies based on their intention:

“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended.”, and this is the intention of the one who carries it out. The level of variance between the people is huge (because of the sincerity in their intention) - to such an extent that you will see two people praying but the difference between them in respect to their rewards is the distance between the east and the west, or the distance between the heavens and the earth; for one of them might be sincere in his intention while the other might not be so.

You may find two people seeking the knowledge of Tawheed or Fiqh (Islaamic Jurisprudence) or Tafseer or Hadeeth, but one is far away from Paradise, while the other is nearer to it, even though they might be reading from the same book and under the same scholar. The reason being, one of them is seeking knowledge of Fiqh in order to become a judge, for a judge has a good salary and a lofty status; whereas the second one studied Fiqh so that he becomes a scholar in order to rectify (the mistakes of) the Ummah of the Prophet ﷺ. So, the difference between them is huge. The Prophet ﷺ said: **“If anyone acquires knowledge of things by which Allaah’s good pleasure is sought, but acquires it only to get some worldly advantage, he will not experience the `arf (the odor) of Paradise.”** [Sunan Abu Dawood (3664), Ibn Maajah (252) and graded as **“Saheeh”** by Shaikh al-Albaanee]

Moreover, the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم gave the similitude of the immigrant, saying: **“So whoever emigrated”**, Al-Hijrah (migration) is taken from the word Al-Hijr, which means leaving off.

Legislatively Al-Hijrah means: moving away from the land of Kufr to the land of Islaam.

An Issue: Hijrah is it compulsory or optional?

Q) The question that arises now is: Is Hijrah compulsory or optional?

A) Migration is compulsory on every individual Muslim who cannot practice Islaam openly in the land of Kufr. His religion will not be perfect if he is not able to practice openly, unless he migrates. And anything without which an obligation is not complete also becomes an obligation (i.e. whatever is required to fulfill an obligation is itself an obligation)^[5]. For example, the migration of the early Muslims to Habasha (Ethiopia), or from Makkah to Madeenah.

[5] This is a rule of Fiqh. Anything which is required to fulfill an obligation itself becomes an obligation. Example: Covering the private parts properly is obligatory for offering the prayers. But a person who recently accepted Islaam and does not have anything with which to cover himself properly, but he does have some money. So, even though going to the market is not obligatory in itself, in this situation it becomes obligatory for him to go to the market and buy that which will cover him properly - this is because he is required to cover his private parts in the prayer, and he would not be covered properly unless he goes to the market to purchase it.

Meaning of “migration towards Allaah and His Messenger”:

“So whoever emigrated for Allaah and His Messenger, then his emigration was for Allaah and His Messenger”, like the person who migrated from Makkah to Madeenah before the conquest of Makkah, seeking Allaah and His Messenger or seeking the reward from Allaah and the nearness to Him, as His تعالى saying:

{ وَإِنْ كُنْتُمْ تُحِبُّونَ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ }

{But if you desire Allaah and His Messenger} [Surah al-Ahzaab (33): 29]

So migrating towards Allaah means: seeking His Countenance and the victory for His religion and this is (the basis of) good intention.

“and seeking nearness to His Messenger” means: grabbing the opportunity of being in his companionship and practicing the Sunnah and defending it, calling towards it and safeguarding it (from innovations) and propagating his religion; for this is the meaning of Hijrah towards the Messenger of Allaah.

Allaah تعالى says in a Hadeeth Qudsi:

مَنْ تَقَرَّبَ إِلَيَّ شِبْرًا تَقَرَّبْتُ إِلَيْهِ ذِرَاعًا

“and if he comes one span nearer to Me, I go one cubit nearer to him” [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (7405, 7356, 7357) and Saheeh Muslim (2675, 2687)]

So if he seeks nearness to Allaah, Allaah تعالى will reward him more than what he has actually done.

An Issue: Is it possible now to migrate towards the Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم?

Q) After the death of the Messenger of Allaah صلى الله عليه وسلم, is it possible to migrate towards him?

A) If one means towards his صلى الله عليه وسلم physical self, then No! A person cannot migrate towards Madeenah with the intention of migrating towards the physical self of the Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم, for he is buried in the earth. But if one means migrating towards his Sunnah and legislation, then this is what we have been encouraged to do and the example of this is going towards a country to spread the Sharee'ah of the Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم and to defend it. So, the migration towards Allaah is possible all the time (i.e. to approach Him through prayers and du`aa). The physical migration towards the Messenger صلى الله عليه وسلم and his Sharee'ah was only possible when he was alive, but after his صلى الله عليه وسلم death, it is towards his Sharee'ah only.

Consider the saying of Allaah تعالى:

{ فَإِنْ تَنَازَعْتُمْ فِي شَيْءٍ فَرُدُّوهُ إِلَى اللَّهِ وَالرَّسُولِ }

{So if you differ in anything amongst yourselves, refer it to Allaah and His Messenger},

[Surah al-Nisaa' (4): 59]

Referring towards Allaah is possible at all times, and towards the physical self of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم was possible only when he was alive, while towards his Sunnah is possible even after his death. So whoever goes from one country to another for teaching Hadeeth, then his migration is towards Allaah and His Messenger, and whoever migrates from one country to another for marrying a woman, when she is engaged to him and says: "I will not marry you until you migrate to my country", so his migration is for what he migrated for.

Migrating for worldly benefits:

"And whoever emigrated for worldly benefits", if (a man) knows that there is a great profit in doing business in a particular country and he migrates towards it for earning profit (wealth) then he will get what he migrated for and he won't get (the reward) except for what he intended. And if Allaah wills that he should not get anything, he won't get anything (losing both the Dunya and the Aakhirah).

The Status of the Saheehain:

Imaam al-Nawawee commented on this: This Hadeeth is reported by the Imaam of the Muhadatheen, Abu `Abdullaah Muhammad bin Ismaa`eel bin Ibraaheem bin al-Mugheerah bin Bardizbah al-Bukhaaree and by Abu al-Husain Muslim bin al-Hajjaaj bin Muslim al-Qushairee al-Nisaabooree in their Saheeh, which are the most authentic books ever written (by a human).

Saheeh al-Bukhaaree is more authentic than Saheeh Muslim; for Imaam al-Bukhaaree made the condition (while recording the Ahaadeeth) that in the narration, the narrator should have met the other narrator from whom he is narrating. But as for Imaam Muslim,

then he was satisfied if the narrator was alive in the same period of the other narrator from whom he is narrating with the possibility of meeting each other. So what Imaam al-Bukhaaree has mentioned is more correct. But the scholars have mentioned that the method of Imaam Muslim in arranging the Ahaadeeth is better than that of al-Bukhaaree; for Imaam Muslim would mention one Hadeeth and then would mention the same Hadeeth with different chains as a witness for the first Hadeeth under a single chapter. But al-Bukhaaree mentions the witnesses under different chapters. So in arrangement, Saheeh Muslim is better and in authenticity Saheeh al-Bukhaaree is better.

And some of the scholars have said: If not for Imaam al-Bukhaaree, Imaam Muslim would not have been able to compile his Saheeh; as al-Bukhaaree was his teacher.

Points of benefit from this Hadeeth:

1. This Hadeeth has been described as the axis of Islaam or that about which the religion revolves around and that is why the scholars have said: the fundamental precepts of Islaam are found in two Ahaadeeth – the first being this Hadeeth and the Hadeeth of `Aaishah رضي الله عنها:

مَنْ عَمِلَ عَمَلًا لَيْسَ عَلَيْهِ أَمْرُنَا فَهُوَ رَدٌّ

“He who does a deed not in accordance with our matter – it will be rejected (it will not be accepted and not rewarded as such)” [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree in mu`allaq form (3/69, 9/107) and Saheeh Muslim (1718)]

The Hadeeth (of `Umar رضي الله عنه) is a pillar for the actions of the heart; it is the means of measuring the hidden actions. Whereas the Hadeeth of `Aaishah رضي الله عنها is the pillar for the actions of the limbs.

For example: A person with sincere intention, intending to achieve the reward from Allaah and the eternal abode. Yet he has fallen into a lot of Bid`ah (innovations). Although his intention is to do good; but judging by his actions we find him doing something evil and disliked, which is not from the Sharee`ah.

Another example: A person got up for praying, completing it in a perfect manner, but only did so out of fear of his father. This is the opposite of sincere intention. Therefore he will not be rewarded for his prayer unless he intends to pray fearing (Allaah) and that he will miss his prayer, and thus becoming a sincere servant.

2. From the benefits of this Hadeeth: it is necessary to differentiate between different forms of worship and between acts of worship and worldly actions, as per the saying of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم **“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention”**, and this can be explained with an example of prayer. A person intends to pray Dhuhr, so he has to make the intention till he differentiates between it and the other prayers.

An Issue: Times when a person forgets to make an intention.

Q) In the afternoon, after performing ablution, if a person goes out of his house and enters the Masjid but he does not intend in his heart if he is going to pray Dhuhr, `Asr or `Ishaa'; but he intends only to pray the prayer which is due at that particular time. So is this sufficient or not?

A) As per the rule which we previously mentioned, then it is not sufficient, because he has not specified whether it is Dhuhr (or `Asr). And this is the Madhhab of al-Hanaabilah (i.e. the Hanbalee Madhhab).

Others say: It is sufficient even if he does not specify which prayer he is going to pray. It is sufficient to make an intention to pray a specific prayer by specifying its time. And this is what has been narrated from Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله. So if a person intends to offer the prayer which is due at that time, then it is sufficient. And this is the correct opinion which the people should follow. Because it may happen that sometimes a person comes to the Masjid hurriedly and he says the Takbeer and enters the prayer with the congregation without it even occurring to him that it is Dhuhr prayer, but it did occur to him that he is going to offer the prayer which was due at that time and that he did not come out of his house except for it.

As per the (Hanbalee) Madhhab's stance, then he has to repeat it. The correct opinion is one does not have to repeat it – and this is the opinion which satisfies the heart because this happens a lot, to an extent that sometimes even the Imaam forgets and makes the Takbeer, intending only to offer the prayer which is due at that time.

3. And from the benefit of this Hadeeth is: Encouragement of sincerity of intention for Allaah عز وجل, for the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم had divided the people into two categories.

One group: Those who intend with their actions the Countenance of Allaah and Paradise.

Second group: Those who are opposite of the first group (seeking the pleasure of this Dunyaa with the actions of the Aakhirah) ^[6].

Therefore it is necessary to take care of Sincerity in intention and that is what one should be motivated towards. This is because it is the first and the most important pillar for which the people were created. Allaah تعالى says:

{ وَمَا خَلَقْتُ الْجِنَّ وَالْإِنْسَ إِلَّا لِيَعْبُدُونِ }

{And I have created not the Jinn and the Men except for my worship} [Surah al-Dhaariyaat (51): 56]

[6] The evidence is the following Hadeeth:

Abu Hurairah رضي الله عنه said: I heard the Messenger of Allaah صلى الله عليه وسلم say: “The first of men (whose case) will be decided on the Day of Judgment will be a man who died as a martyr. He shall be brought (before the Judgment Seat). Allaah will make him recount His blessings (i. e. the blessings which He had bestowed upon him) and he will recount them (and admit having enjoyed them in his life). (Then) will Allaah say: {What did you do (to requite these blessings)?} He will say: I fought for You until I died as a martyr. Allaah will say: {You have told a lie. You fought that you might be called a “brave warrior”. And you were called so}. (Then) orders will be passed against him and he will be dragged with his face downward and cast into Hell. Then will be brought forward a man who acquired knowledge and imparted it (to others) and recited the Qur’aan. He will be brought and Allaah will make him recount His blessings and he will recount them (and admit having enjoyed them in his lifetime). Then will Allaah ask: {What did you do (to requite these blessings)?} He will say: I acquired knowledge and disseminated it and recited the Qur’aan seeking Your pleasure. Allaah will say: {You have told a lie. You acquired knowledge so that you might be called “a scholar”, and you recited the Qur’aan so that it might be said: “He is a Qaari” and such has been said.} Then orders will be passed against him and he shall be dragged with his face downward and cast into the Fire. Then will be brought a man whom Allaah had made abundantly rich and had granted every kind of wealth. He will be brought and Allaah will make him recount His blessings and he will recount them and (admit having enjoyed them in his lifetime). Allaah will (then) ask: {What have you done (to requite these blessings)?} He will say: I spent money in every cause in which You wished that it should be spent. Allaah will say: {You are lying. You did (so) that it might be said about (You): “He is a generous fellow” and so it was said.} Then will Allaah pass orders and he will be dragged with his face downward and thrown into Hell.” [Saheeh Muslim (4688)]

4. And from the benefit of this Hadeeth is: The Prophet ﷺ using the best way to teach and that is by broadening the subject and dividing it.

As for his ﷺ broadening the speech, then it is his saying: **“Verily the reward of deeds depends upon the intention”**, which denotes the action itself; **“and verily every person will get the reward according to what he has intended”**, this is the one who is doing it.

The second: dividing Hijrah into two categories: Shar`ee (legislated) and ghair Shar`ee (non-legislated).

This is from the good ways of teaching and why it is necessary for the teachers not to quote numerous issues one after the other to the students, because this way they will forget. But what they should do is, teach them the principles, the rules and their limitations (and conditions) because that is the closest way of retaining the knowledge in the heart. In contrast if one lists the many different issues (one after the other), the students will forget them quickly.

5. From the benefits of this Hadeeth is: the name of the Prophet ﷺ is mentioned together with the name of Allaah تعالى with “و” (and) when he ﷺ said:

“towards Allaah and His Messenger”, and the Prophet ﷺ did not say: **“ثم رسوله”**

(then His Messenger), whereas when the person said to the Prophet ﷺ:

“Whatever Allaah Wills and what you (O Muhammad) will”, the Prophet ﷺ instructed him to say: **“Whatever Allaah Wills alone.”** [Musnad Ahmad (1839) and al-Adab al-Mufrad (783) and it is **“Saheeh”**]

A) As long as it is related to the Sharee`ah, then it is expressed with “و” (and), because whatever comes from the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم in regards to the religion is as coming from Allaah تعالى, as He تعالى said:

{ مَنْ يُطِيعِ الرَّسُولَ فَقَدْ أَطَاعَ اللَّهَ }

{He who obeys the Messenger (Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم), has indeed obeyed Allaah}

[Surah al-Nisaa' (4):80]

But in regards to the universal matters: then it is strictly not allowed to associate anyone with Allaah by using “و” - (and this is) because everything is under the Will of Allaah alone and His Decree (and He shares his dominion with no one else).

So if someone asks: Will it rain tomorrow?

And if someone replies to him saying: Allaah and His Messenger know the best, then this is wrong because the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم does not have the knowledge of this.

An Issue: Is it Halaal or Haraam?

Q) If someone asks: is this Halaal or Haraam?

And if he is replied back: Allaah and His Messenger know the best (at the time when he صلى الله عليه وسلم was alive), then this is correct, because the command of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم in religious matters is the command of Allaah عز وجل, as Allaah تعالى says:

{ مَنْ يُطِيعِ الرَّسُولَ فَقَدْ أَطَاعَ اللَّهَ }

{He who obeys the Messenger (Muhammad ﷺ), has indeed obeyed Allaah}

[Surah al-Nisaa' (4):80]

An Issue: What is better, (seeking) knowledge or Jihaad?

Q) What is better, (seeking) knowledge or Jihaad in the way of Allaah?

A) The answer is: (seeking) knowledge is better than doing Jihaad in the way of Allaah, because everyone is in need of knowledge.

Imaam Ahmad رحمه الله said: "There is nothing like (seeking) `ilm for the one who has the correct intention."

And it is not possible to make Jihaad obligatory upon every individual (Fardh `Ain) because of the saying of Allaah تعالى:

{ وَمَا كَانَ الْمُؤْمِنُونَ لِيَنْفِرُوا كَافَّةً }

{And it is not (proper) for the believers to go out to fight (Jihad) all together} [Surah al-Tawbah (9): 122]

And if it were Fardh `Ain, then it would have been obligatory upon every Muslim:

{ فَلَوْلَا نَفَرَ مِنْ كُلِّ فِرْقَةٍ مِنْهُمْ طَائِفَةٌ }

{Of every troop of them, only a party should go forth} [Surah al-Tawbah (9): 122]

Meaning: (a group should go forth) and group should stay behind.

{ لِيَتَفَقَّهُوا فِي الدِّينِ وَلِيُنذِرُوا قَوْمَهُمْ إِذَا رَجَعُوا إِلَيْهِمْ لَعَلَّهُمْ يَحْذَرُونَ }

{So that they (who are left behind) may get instructions in religion, and that they may warn their people when they return to them, so that they may beware (of evil)} [Surah al-Tawbah (9): 122]

It also differs depending upon the doer and also differs depending upon the time.

Depending upon the doer: For example, we say to one person: It is better for you to go for Jihaad. And to the other we say: It is better for you to seek knowledge. For if a person is brave, strong and active but he is not that intelligent, then it is better for him to go for Jihaad, because this is what is suitable for him. And if a person is intelligent, has good memory and strong in persuasion, then it is better for him to seek knowledge. So, this is how it differs depending upon the doer.

Depending upon the situation (time): As for the time, then if we are in a time where the scholars are many and there is a need to fill the gaps in the frontline, then it is better to go for Jihaad. But if we are in a time where ignorance is prevailing and Bid`ah has begun to appear among the people (i.e. people do Bid`ah more openly) and is spreading, then seeking knowledge is better.

There are three things which make it imperative to seek knowledge:

- i. When the Bid`ah has emerged more openly and its evil has spread.
- ii. When people give Fatwaa without `ilm.
- iii. When people argue in (religious) matters without `ilm.

6. And from the benefits of this Hadeeth is: doing migration is one of the righteous acts. This is because the person intends with it (the pleasure of) Allaah and His Messenger. And every action with which a person seeks (the pleasure of) Allaah and His Messenger is a righteous act; because through it the person seeks the nearness to Allaah. And seeking nearness to Allaah is worship.

An Issue: Is Hijrah obligatory or something preferred? (Additional points)

Q) Is Hijrah (Migration) obligatory or something preferred?

A) There are details to it. If a person is allowed to practice his religion and to preach openly and that there is no one who objects to it, then in this case Hijrah only becomes Mustahab (preferred). But if he is not allowed to, then Hijrah becomes Waajib (obligatory). The circumstances are what make it either Mustahab or Waajib. And this is in reference to the countries of the Kuffaar.

But as for the countries where there are sinners, i.e. the places where sins are more apparent, then we say: If the person fears for himself that he might slip into the same sins which the people of the land have fallen into, then Hijrah is Waajib. If not, then Hijrah is not Waajib. Rather we say: If his staying in that country will help them (the sinners) in reforming, then his staying there is Waajib, because that country is in need of him for reforming, and for enjoining what is good and for forbidding what is evil.

It is astonishing that some people migrate from the lands of Islaam (and Muslims) to the lands of the Kuffaar. If the reformers (the righteous people) were to migrate from the country, then who will be left for (reforming) the sinners? And it may happen that the country (and its people) will slip deeper into sins because there were only a few reformers and more sinners. But if they stayed, and called the people towards Allaah, things would change and the people would be reformed; and those people will reform those other than them so that there is reformation in the land due to them. If the general mass is reformed, then it is more likely that those in authority will also be reformed, even if there are obstacles along the path.

It is a sad state of affairs to say, but the ones who cause more harm are (some of) the reformers themselves. So one will find these righteous people forming factions and divided (into different groups), and that there is disunity amongst them only because they differed in one of the issues of the religion, in which differences can be tolerated.^[7] This is the reality, especially in the lands where Islaam is not firmly established. So they have enmity, hatred and rivalry towards one other, only because of an issue such as Raf`al-yadain (raising of both hands before and after Rukoo`) in the Salaah.

Let me (Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen) tell you about an incident which happened with me while I

[7] The difference of opinions in the matters of Fiqh should be tolerated when both the parties have proofs for their opinions. Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen رحمه الله has an excellent book on the subject of the various reasons which give rise to the differences of opinion amongst the scholars. But in the matters of Manhaj and `Aqeedah (Creed), there is no room for personal opinions and interpretations; neither is there any cooperation with the people of Bid`ah and desires from the Soofees, the Shi`a, the Ash`arees, the Jahmees and other than them from the many different sects, till they follow the `Aqeedah and the Manhaj of Ahl al-Sunnah wal-Jamaa`ah. Shaikh al-`Uthaymeen رحمه الله himself has refuted many deviated ideologies in the matters of `Aqeedah in his books. So, difference of opinion in the matters of Fiqh can be tolerated but not in the matters of `Aqeedah and Manhaj.

was in Mina (during Hajj). In one of those days, one of the heads of a delegation came to me with two groups from Africa which made Takfeer of each other (i.e. calling each other Kaafir), and do you know on what basis?! It was said: One group says: “The Sunnah while standing in Qiyaam (after getting up from Rukoo`) is to put the hands on the chest”. While the other said: “the Sunnah is to release them (to the side)”. This issue was from sub-branches (of the matters of Fiqh) and easy (to clarify) and it was not from the Fundamentals (of the religion). They said: “No! For the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said:

مَنْ رَغِبَ عَنْ سُنَّتِي فَلَيْسَ مِنِّي

“He who does not follow my tradition in religion, is not from me (not one of my followers).” [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (5063) and Saheeh Muslim (1401)]”

The Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم is free from this type of kufr (for he صلى الله عليه وسلم never did that). And based on this wrong interpretation and understanding, one of them made the takfeer of the other.

It is worth mentioning that in the countries where Islaam is not as resilient, some of the “reformers” innovate (in the religion) and misguide one another. Had they come to an agreement; and when differed on a matter, overlooked the matters where difference of opinion is permissible, they would have been a single body and the Ummah would have been rectified. However, the Ummah observes that the reformers and “upholders of the Deen” have this hatred and these differences with one another in the matters of the Deen. (By Allaah!) It should be feared that whatever one has of goodness and guidance could be seized away.^[8] A youth trying to be firm (in the Deen), believing that there is only goodness and guidance in the religion; but then he observes otherwise that the righteous have sharp disagreements and hatred (towards each other), might leave off being firm (in religion) due to not finding what he was looking for.

In short, the migration from the lands of the kuffaar is not similar to migration from the countries where there are more sinners. So it would be said to the person (who wants to migrate from the place where there are more sinners): Be patient and seek your reward (from Allaah), especially when you are a reformer. Rather it is said to him: Migration for you is Haraam.

End of the Sheikh's رحمه الله words...

Summary

Everything we do has to be intended to be for Allaah. For anything we do we want to make sure that it will be acceptable to Him and will not in any way interfere with the upholding of His Deen. A good action with the wrong intention will not get us any reward in the Hereafter.

[8] This is in reference to the following Aayah:

{ أَفَنَضْرِبُ عَنْكُمُ الذِّكْرَ صَفْحًا أَنْ كُنْتُمْ قَوْمًا مُسْرِفِينَ }

{Should We then take this Reminder away from you and ignore you because you are a nation who has transgressed all limits?} [Surah al-Zukhruf (43):5]

A Clarification: Can we judge someone's intention?

Translator's Note: It is sometimes observed that when a person makes a mistake and another one comes up to correct him, a third person would be found saying: "Who are you to judge him? Only Allaah knows his intention" (or something similar).

Yes, we cannot judge someone based on his intention, as has been clarified in this Hadeeth:

Usaamah bin Zaid رضي الله عنه narrated that the Messenger of Allaah صلى الله عليه وسلم sent us in a raiding party. We raided al-Huraqah of Juhainah in the morning. I caught hold of a man and he said: "None has the right to be worshipped but Allaah", I attacked him with a spear. It once occurred to me and I talked about it to the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم. The Messenger of Allaah صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **"You killed him after he had said: 'None has the right to be worshipped but Allaah?'"** I said: Messenger of Allaah صلى الله عليه وسلم, he made a profession of it out of the fear of the weapon. He (the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم) replied: **"Did you tear his heart in order to find out whether it had professed or not?"** And he went on repeating it to me till I wished I had embraced Islaam that day. [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (4269) and Saheeh Muslim (176) and the wordings are his.]

But from this Hadeeth we learn two points:

- i. No one knows what the heart conceals except Allaah and this is clarified from the Prophet's statement: **"Did you tear his heart..."**
- ii. And from the statement of the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم said: **"You killed him after he had said: 'None has the right to be worshipped but Allaah?'"**, we learn that we are supposed to make judgments based on the face value and on their outer actions.

This is further supported by the statement of `Umar رضي الله عنه:

Narrated `Umar bin Al-Khattaab رضي الله عنه: **People were (sometimes) judged by the revealing of a Divine Inspiration during the lifetime of Allaah's Apostle صلى الله عليه وسلم but now there is no longer any more (new revelation). Now we judge you by the deeds you practice publicly, so we will trust and favor the one who does good deeds in front of us, and we will not call him to account about what he is really doing in secret, for Allaah will judge him for that; but we will not trust or believe the one who presents to us with an evil deed even if he claims that his intentions were good.** [Saheeh al-Bukhaaree (2460)]

So, when someone makes a mistake, then it is futile to remain silent and just say: “We don’t know what his intention was.” We can make an excuse for him that he might have done it out of mistake or that he didn’t know it any better. But we cannot remain silent. Rather, we should correct the mistake – but in a way most honorable, so that the one who made the mistake accepts the correction. And similarly we warn against the mistake so that the people should not – unknowingly - accept it as the truth.

And were we to let the people do what they want based on the statement: “We do not know what his intention was/is?” Then, we would have to let go of all the prisoners and remove the judicial system because we do not know what the person was intending when he killed someone; and we do not know what the person was intending when he robbed someone.

We do not judge the intentions, we judge the actions.

We ask Allaah ﺟﻞ ﻭﻋﻠﻰ, by his beautiful names and attributes that He unites our hearts upon the truth, and that He makes us sincere advisers to one another based on the Qur'aan and Sunnah as understood by the Companions.

ﻭﺼﻠﻰ ﺍﻟﻠﻪ ﻭﺳﻠﻢ ﻭﺑﺎﺭﻙ ﻋﻠﻰ ﻧﺒﻴﻨﺎ ﻣﺤﻤﺪ ﻭﻋﻠﻰ ﺁﻟﻪ ﻭﺁﺼﺤﺎﺑﻪ ﻭﻣﻦ ﺗﺒﻌﻬﻢ ﺑﺎﺣﺴﺎﻥ ﺇﻟﻰ ﻳﻮﻡ ﺍﻟﺪﻳﻦ